

Divineness of the Word of Holy Qur'an

Mohammd Sheibani

Faculty member of Al-Mustafa University, Branch of Mashhad

E-mail: sheibanimohamad@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT — One of the questions that rose about whether the words of the Holy Qur'an are Divine Revelation similar to the content and meaning: Or the content of Holy Qur'an was revealed to the Holy Prophet (PBUH) from God, and he transferred the content in the form of words. There are two perspectives here: First viewpoint is that the words of Holy Qur'an are part of the revelation as all Muslims believe so. Second viewpoint is that the words of the Holy Qur'an are written by a human not by God. According to this viewpoint, the words of Holy Qur'an are sayings of the Holy Prophet, only the content is divine revelation. The Theory of the words of the Holy Qur'an, not being divine revelation has been abandoned and rejected theory throughout Islamic history. This is why it has not a severe topic of discussion at all. This theory is against Holy Qur'an and the Sunnah (Words and Action of the Prophet) as it is mentioned clearly in Surah Al-Fataha,

"They wish to change Allah's Word."

This theory is raised because of conspiracy of the enemies of Islam. How can the words of Holy Qur'an be created by Muhammad (PBUH) or Gabriel yet it is believed that the Holy Qur'an to be a miracle. In this article we will define the concept of revelation then we will mention different views and remarks about it. We will examine and analyze the views. In the end, the correct view will be mentioned with evidences, finally it will be concluded that the Holy Qur'an is the word of God, not the word of Prophet (PBUH), because if we refer a phrase to a person; it means he expressed his ideas in his own words. If the Prophet (PBUH) composed the words of Holy Qur'an and expressed the meaning of revelation in his own words, then Holy Qur'an is not going to be the Word of God. The term "Word of God" indicates that the concept of "word" is considered. It is clear, words of the Holy Qur'an are Divine and the entire words can be referred and attributed to God.

KEY WORDS: Revelation, Miracles, Words of the Holy Qur'an, Revelation, Not Revelation

Introduction

One of the issues that is raised in some journals in present days, is the question that:

Is the words of Holy Qur'an divine revelation or not? Whether the words of the Holy Qur'an are from God, as its content and the meaning, and Prophet (PBUH) did not have any kind of involvement in composing the words or in contrary to it, the text of Holy Qur'an was created by the Prophet (PBUH), it means that the Holy Qur'an is experience of the inner self of Prophet (PBUH) that he expressed it in his own phrases? This query has been asked about the sacred texts of Christianity as well, but there are two major differences between the motives and the purpose of question that have been asked about bible and the Holy Qur'an: First, the background of the question about the Holy Qur'an started centuries ago; as it is understood from the narration in "Al-itqan" written by Seeyuti and "Al-Burhan" written by Zarkeshi. This question and the creation of the opinion concerning the word of Holy Qur'an not being revelation, was an issue inside the religion, initiated by the follower of the religion because of particulars understanding of some verses or have a specific opinion about the "Word of God". However we will remark later on in detail. In Christianity initially this question was introduced very late and secondly, the reason this question was raised was some incompatibility of the bible with scientific achievements. Before that there was pretty much consensus that the bible's word and the meaning both are divine revelation. Another difference is that even though the above question emerged late in Christianity but it got its answer very soon. After the development of historical research about the Bible and how it was shaped, the fact was revealed that the Bible is written by man and it was not even written by Moses and Jesus, rather by their certain followers who were born after the life of these honorable Prophets, and the doubt that appeared about the words of the Bible being divine or not was changed into negativity and denial. But in the case of Holy Qur'an, it is opposite to Bible, i.e. the opinion of words of Holy Qur'an not being divine revelation was found as the rare and unusual opinion from the beginning, as the time passed this opinion became more rejected and abandoned, Development of science did not fade the facts of Holy Qur'an,

rather it approved for its accuracy and authenticity. Why this rare idea is raised again, it is because some people are following the western intellectuals; who are trying to bring the challenges and crises of Christianity to the Islamic world. In this article we will try to examine the issue of words of Holy Qur'an being divine revelation, not from the perspective that this issue is important, but it's for certain attitudes toward religion, whether or not are based on the opinion of words of Holy Qur'an not being divine revelation.

The Concept of revelation

One of the major duties of the prophets is to receive the divine message which is named as "Wahee" revelation. Speaking about the nature and reality of revelation is very difficult and "Reality of Revelation" is not achievable, because the revelation is not a natural phenomenon which cannot be understood by scientific and standard tools; it is an extraordinary phenomenon between God and some selected people (Prophets): If someone has not reached to that point, hence cannot judge the essence and reality of revelation. But its meaning and its concept is reasonable and achievable. According to the sayings of the Holy Prophets, we can pretty much understand the concept of revelation by the help of intellect, reason and self-recognition

a) The literal meaning: Ibne Manzoor writes in the Dictionary of Lisan-Ol-Arab, Revelation means, giving a sign, writing, letter, inspiration and hidden words and anything inspires other being is called "Revelation" while it was hidden from others. (Ibne Manzoor, Lisan-Ol-Arab, Volume 15, Page 240) Ragheb Esfahani writes in his Dictionary Al-Mufradat: Root of the revelation is quick sign, it is because of this anything that is done quick is called revelation "Wahee". This can be cryptic or figurative words, it can be a non-verbal sound, it can be an indication to some organs or it can be written. (Ragheb Esfahani, Al-Mufradat Fi Gharaib Al Holy Qur'an, p 515) linguistics believe the most comprehensive meanings of the word "revelation" is conveying and making someone understand quickly and secretly that it would be understood by the person who is being addressed not anyone else. This meaning is common meaning of revelation and it is applicable on all the meanings of revelation. Whether it is existential command to inanimate body or it is innate instincts of animal or it is natural understanding that comes to the heart of the normal and regular person or it is understanding the sets of divine law (Sharia) by prophets through a sign or hidden voice or written by human. In all these cases understanding quickly and secretly lies there. (Mostafavi, Al-Tahqeeq Fi Al-Al-Kalamat Al-Holy Qur'an, Volume 3, Page 55) Terminological meaning: In Islamic terminology revelation is message of God to Prophets by linking them to the unseen world and establishing a relationship with the supernatural world. Since this type of messaging is fast and hidden form others, hence it is called "revelation". (Naseheyan, Wahee Az Manzare Holy Qur'an o Hadees, p 41)

Allama Tabatabai writes: The revelation is divine words (immaterial) that some people – If God willing – achieve it and receive divine instructions through revelation and education by God (Holy Qur'an In Islam, by Tabatabae Page 85)

The concept of religious experience

Experience is an event that one goes through (either as a partaker or as an observer) and he/she is aware of it. There are many types of experience and it comprises a wide range of different categories. Including: artistic experience, ethical experience, experience of pleasure, sensory experience etc... But religious experience is different from common experience. In this experience person establishes connection with the supernatural world or ultimate truth. For example, manifestation of God in things and people like Prophet Jesus, Virgin Mary, to see the angel or to talk to an angel. (Aqal wa Etiqade Deeni, written by Michael Peterson and other. Page 37, 36) Furthermore in religious experience, one who experiences believes that describing that experience is based on natural phenomenon is incompatible and insufficient, and it should be explained on the basis of religious teachings. In other words, religious people give their experience a religious interpretation and they describe their experience according to religious teachings. Therefore; there are two conditions for an experience to be religious; first one is that it should occur within boundaries of religion, and the second one is that the person who had particular experience should describe his state by the help of religious concept (Kalame Jadeed, written by Sadeqi Page 132-134) Religious experience, is an experience that is created by the Prophet directly encountering God, it is imbued with religious experiences. In this confrontation neither a message nor a statement is exchanged in between nor is any information transferred to Prophet. The Prophet finds himself encountering a divine affair. And what he conveys to public as revelation is not word of God. It is just an interpretation of his experience.

Difference between Revelation and Religious Experience

There are fundamental differences between revelation and religious experience that reject the illusion of considering the revelation and religious experience equal. This distinction can be outlined as follow:

1. The Revelation that descends from God to his messenger has amazing power that can demonstrate some extraordinary affect which shows Prophet have divine extraordinary power. This is true evidence for their invitation being from God (invitation to the faith) and for revelation being divine. This extraordinary demonstration shown by the Prophet is called by the Holy Qur'an as "Aya" means a sign on the prophecy of the Prophet, since this sign show the incapability of others so Islamic theologians named it as "Miracle". Thus, the basic features of revelation are miracles; that distinguishes it from religious experience. With a little reflection we can see that religious experience cannot be a miracle.

2. Another point about the difference between religious and mystical experience is the experience of the person who experiences it, is influenced by his previous cultures and beliefs. When this person is having a mystical experience he can see the production of his past and future when he is asleep or awake, hence believes and culture gives particular identity to the experience.

But the revelation of the Prophet is in contrary to the religious experience; the revelation that the Prophet use to receive use to be against believes and ideas of his time, and something that would completely change the prevailing circumstances and culture of his time. It was not only changes the prevailing thoughts and opinions; rather it uses to change the ethical and social values of that time. Thus, revelation of prophets is in contrary to the religious and mystical experience, which is influenced by their time and culture. In fact, one of the qualities of the Prophets is not being influenced by the environment and era they are living in; which is called "infallibility". As the Scholar Muttahari said that the immunity from sin and error means neither they are influenced by the desire nor they commit sin nor they make mistake, hence, their thoughts and actions are not influenced by social habits and culture of their time. So, when revelation is descended upon them from God, without the slightest manipulation they convey it to the public. From here you can understand the differences between the prophet and genius people. Genius people are those who have strong power of thinking, pondering and calculating. It means they get connected to the things by their senses and work on the information they have collected by their strong calculating power; and get the results, probably their calculation can result an error as well. Prophets in addition to the power of thinking and a sharp intellect, they are equipped with another power called "revelation". While genius people lack this power. Therefore Prophets and genius people cannot be compared; because the comparison is true when both groups are from one type. But since both are from two different types, the comparison is wrong.

3. There is another difference between the revelation and religious experience, is that one of the necessities of Prophetic revelation is leadership. Although the way of Prophet-hood starts from getting nearness to God and getting disconnected from people (called Journey from creature to the creator) which means leave the outer and pay attention to the inner, but finally Prophet-hood ends up to people and outer part (called journey to creature with creator) , to guide people to a pleasant life.

(Collected Works of Muttahari, Volume 2, Page 159-160)

Consequences of Words of Holy Qur'an not Being Divine Revelation

Before we examine their proves, it is important to raise this question, that if we believe that words of the Holy Qur'an are not revelation and it is just made by human, what consequences we are going to face? To the answer the question we can consider the following point as the consequences of words of the Holy Qur'an not being revelation:

1. The first consequence of this theory is that it will finish the sanctity of words of the Holy Qur'an. Muslims have always valued and respected the words of the Holy Qur'an, and use art of calligraphy for words of the Holy Qur'an, knowledge of recitation and intonation of the Holy Qur'an was found to recite the words of the Holy Qur'an in a better way, being clean when touching words of The Holy Qur'an, all of this shows the sanctity and value for the words of the Holy Qur'an among Muslims. If we believe the word of the Holy Qur'an are humanly this sanctity will vanish, and will make the words of the Holy Qur'an as common as ordinary books.

2. The second consequence of this opinion is that it we will have to deny the miraculous perspective of the words of the Holy Qur'an. One of the miracles of the Holy Qur'an which was visible from the time of the Holy Prophet was the miracle of expressiveness of the Holy Qur'an; in other words rhetorical miracle of the Holy Qur'an and the miracle of its eloquence. Scientific miracle is another type of miracle, where the Holy Qur'an informs about scientific development and innovation of humans, fourteen centuries ago. But the most important miracle of the Holy Qur'an which has been accepted unanimously by scholars from beginning of the revelation till now and it is central point of the Holy Qur'an's challenge is the miracle of the eloquence and expressiveness. There are different levels of this miracle, like; its beauty, its rhythmical nature, its incomparable preciseness, its easiness and simplicity, its order and systematic selection. In this context miracle means saying the words with particular characteristics which is beyond the ability of human. No man has power to make a sentence like the Holy Qur'an. Accepting the opinion of words of the Holy Qur'an not being divine revelation will cause to deny the miracle of the words of the

Holy Qur'an. If the words and phrases of the Holy Qur'an are composed by humans then obviously other people can make phrases better than that or at least resembling to that one. We come to the conclusion that the miraculous text of the Holy Qur'an is the best proof to reject the opinion of the words of the Holy Qur'an not being divine revelation. We will explain this in detail later on.

3. The third consequence of accepting the opinion of words of the Holy Qur'an not being divine revelation is ignoring and skipping the text of the Holy Qur'an. This will lead us to ignore the text of the Holy Qur'an when understanding the religion.

4. Another consequence is that the idea of religious pluralism. Infrastructure of religious pluralism is based on the idea that no religion is complete carrier of truth rather every religion carries a part of the truth. Therefore no one can have any monopoly and comprehensiveness. (Journal of Holy Qur'anic Studies written by Hussain, No. 21-22)

Explaining the views

Before presenting the different point of view and examining them, initially we will define all possible assumptions then we will analyze them. It looks like; we can define five assumptions for this topic:

1. The revelation that descended upon Holy Prophet (PBUH) was only meaning (not word) of teachings of the Holy Qur'an and Prophet (PBUH) gave a shape to the meaning and conveyed it to the people. (Tafseere Al-Meezan written by Tabatabai, Volume 15, Page 317)

Tabatabai mentioned this as one of the assumptions, but he does not believe in it.

2. Teaching of the Holy Qur'an and the concept came from God but the words were designed by arch angel Jibraeel (Gabriel) and he conveyed to the Prophet. (Al-Burhan Fi Uloom-el- Quran written by Zarkashi, Volume 1, Page 291) Zarkashi mentioned this assumption, but he does not believe it.

3. Only words, Phrase and sentence were revealed upon Holy Prophet (PBUH). Prophet concluded the meaning by the help of the words. (Quran Shenasee written by Misbah Yazdi, Volume 1, Page 93)

Author just mentions this view, but he does not believe in it.

4. Both, the words and the meaning of the Holy Qur'an composed by Holy Prophet, it is referred to God merely because God made the ground for meaning and the word to be said by the Holy Prophet (Al Meezan written by Tabatabai, Volume 15, Page 317)

He noted the assumption, but he believes in the fifth assumption.

5. Meaning, words, terms and phrases of the Holy Qur'an all are from God. Holy Prophet received them all from God and conveyed it to the people without altering a single word and meaning.

After examining all five viewpoints we come to understand that some of the five assumptions are not accepted by any of the commentator (Moffaser).

Zarkashi writes the following three views which are in accordance with three of those five assumptions:

First view: the meaning of the words and phrases in the Holy Qur'an was revealed from Allah and Gabriel and the Prophet (pbuh) were the only two intermediaries in conveying the message of God to mankind. (Assumption number five)

Second view: only the meaning of the Holy Qur'an was revealed from God by means of Gabriel to Holy Prophet. Holy Prophet poured the meaning into the words and sentences and then demonstrated to the believers. (Assumption number one)

Third view: the meaning of the Holy Qur'an was taught to Gabriel and Gabriel composed the words for meaning then he conveyed them to the Holy Prophet. (Al-Burhan written by Zarkashi, 1/291) (Assumption number two)

Although Zarkashi did not name the adherents of each of the above three perspectives, but before quoting the views the point he expressed shows that Sunnis believe in the first point of view:

Seyooti also quotes the first three views, and he emphasizes on the first perspective and provides some evidence for it. (Al-Etqan Fe Uloom Al-Holy Qur'an written by Seyooti. 1/58 and 59) It is understood from the words of Zarkani that only three above views were accepted by the experts, and the last two assumptions (Third and fourth assumption) were not mentioned at all or it was not popular entirely among the religious scholars. (Mahelul Irfan, 1/41 and 41) We obtain from the words of Allama Tabatabai that the fourth assumption has (words and the meaning as well are both from Prophet) some supporters, he called this view as unreasonable one then rejected it and did not bother himself to quote its supporter. More unreasonable than the fourth point of view (meaning of the Holy Qur'an is from God but the words are from Holy Prophet) is view that says: the words and meanings of the Holy Qur'an both are from Prophet that a level of his soul called Roohul Ameen (Gabriel) induced the Holy Qur'an to another level of his soul called Qalb (heart). Out of different assumptions and perspectives about words of the Holy Qur'an, only two perspectives are generally accepted by Muslim scholars and the experts in the religious field. From the

beginning till now most of the discussions belongs to these two perspectives. In order to mention them in brief, we will mention and examine both perspectives but for more details refer to other sources.

We will mention these two viewpoints in brief and refer the detail to other resources.

1. meanings and words of the Holy Qur'an, both are From God

The dominant view among Muslims since the early ages of divine revelation till now, was based on the principle that the Holy Qur'an, with all of its contents, including the phrases and compositions was descended upon the Holy Prophet (PBUH); and the Holy Prophet received the message from God, and delivered it to the mankind as a mediator between the creator and the creature without the slightest changes in a single word. (Manahel Al-Irfan Fi Uloomel Holy Qur'an, written by Zarkashi 1/44, Al Burhan Fi Uloom el Qur'an 1/290, Al-Tamheed Fi Uloom el Qur'an written by Marefaat) The efforts that Holy Prophet made in order to save the Holy Qur'an from any changes and distortion, was like asking a large amount of believers to write and record the exact verses, teaching the verses of the Holy Qur'an immediately after it was revealed, organizing the information team in order to educate Holy Qur'an to the Muslims in other areas, emphasis on reading and memorizing Holy Qur'an, all suggest that the word, phrase, and combinations of Qur'anic teachings, are originated from infinitive source of divine knowledge. Practical conduct of Muslims when encountering the Holy Qur'an demonstrated this fact. Muslims have given the same level of importance to the understanding of the concepts of the Holy Qur'an and have attempted to stop the formation of any deviation in this field, as they focused on the understanding of the words, sentences, modes of composition, structure of the eloquence, the appearance of the text, innovative style and rhythmic eloquence of the Holy Qur'an. Efforts of Muslim scholars concerning the appearance and verbal style of the Holy Qur'an, was based on belief in the words of the Holy Qur'an are from God. Many issues concerning the manifestations of the Holy Qur'an, the possibility to understand and interpret the Holy Qur'an, translation of the Holy Qur'an into other languages, collecting, compiling, writing the Holy Qur'an, successive reliability of the Holy Qur'an throughout different periods and the concept of the Holy Qur'an cannot be distorted any time, all this kind of believes in divine scripture suggest the Holy Qur'an's content and its shape both are originated from God. Belief in the word of the Holy Qur'an being divine text have been so deep among faithful that the Holy Qur'an was considered as a sacred text all the time and it is respected by Muslims, it is considered above humanly text and placed in a unique position.

Evidence of the first view

Many proofs have been presented for the words of the Holy Quran being divine; as we will refer to some of them:

1. Holy Qur'an has introduced itself as words of God.

"If any of the idolaters ask you to give them refuge, give them asylum so that they may hear the words of God."
Surah To'uba (chapter 9) verse 6

Also in the Surah Baqarah (Chapter 2) verse 75 and Surah Fatah (Chapter 48) verse 15 the term of "Word of God" have been mentioned. Attributing and referring sentence to speaker is logical and reasonable as long as the speaker was responsible in the selection, compilation, arrangement of words, shaping the structure and composition of the sentence. (Al-Tamheed Fi Uloom el Qur'an written by Marefaat, 1/210). But if the mediator conveys the idea and the concept of the first person to the public with his own selection, arrangement and combination of the words, so logically the words will be referred to the mediator not the first person. Referring to the words to the first person will be unreasonable. (Al-Tamheed Fi Uloom el Qur'an written by Marefaat. Manahel ol Irfan Fi Uloom ul Qur'an written by Zarqani 1/4)

2. No doubt one of the major parts of miracle of the Holy Qur'an is its apparent text structure, exquisite style and unique manner. Incomparable eloquence of the Holy Qur'an which was a miracle accepted unanimously by experts of Arabic language after they have seen the words and text of the Holy Qur'an. The message given from the verses of "Challenge" was a call for mankind, that if you have any doubt in this text being divine so in order to prove your claim, make a sentence or a phrase like the Holy Qur'an. The challenge and the inability of infidels to make a sentence like the Holy Qur'an indicate that the verbal structure and the style of expression are from God. No human brain even the Holy Prophet was not involved in formation of the Holy Qur'an's text.

Zarqani says about that:

(Manahelul Irfan Fi Uloomul Holy Qur'an written Zarqani, 1/44)

3. Many verses of the Holy Qur'an indicate clearly that the Arabic text of Holy Qur'an is of divine origin. Some of these verses are as follow:

*"We have made it an Arabic reading text so that perhaps you may understand * And verily, it is in the Mother of the Book, in Our Presence, high (in dignity), full of wisdom."* Surah Zukhruf (Chapter 43)
Verse 34

"Before this (Holy Qur'an), the Book of Moses was a guide and a blessing. This Book confirms the Torah. It is in the Arabic language so that it may warn the unjust people, and give glad news to the righteous ones." Surah Ahqaf (Chapter 46) Verse 12

In the top Verse the sentence structure and Arabic language in the Holy Qur'an is explicitly attributed to God, it is very clear that the "language " and " Arabic" is got nothing to do with content and it one of the literal descriptions of the text. Another verse from Holy Qur'an is a poof for lack of involvement of Prophet in the structure of the text and the strict obedience of Holy Prophet of divine revelation. Some examples of these are given below:

"Whenever Our authoritative revelations are recited to those who do not wish to meet Us in the life hereafter, say, "Bring us another book besides this one or change it." (Muhammad), tell them, "I cannot change it myself. I only follow what is revealed to me. I fear that for disobeying my Lord I shall be punished on the great" Surah Yunus (Chapter 10) Verse 15

"He does not speak out of his own desires. It is a revelations which has been revealed to him" Surah Najm (Chapter 53) Verse 3-4

In addition to the above, other verses about recitation and about Holy Qur'an being reveled upon the Holy Prophet. The following are some examples of these verses:

"And recite what has been revealed to thee of the Book of thy Lord: none can change His words and none wilt thou find as a refuge other than Him." Surah Kahf (chapter 18) Verse 27

"The unbelievers have said, "Why was the whole Holy Qur'an not revealed to him at once?" We have revealed it to you in gradual steps to strengthen your hearts and give you explanations." Surah Furqan (Chapter 25) Verse 32

"We shall be responsible for its collection and its recitation. When we recite it, follow its recitation (by us)." Surah Qiyamat (Chapter 75) Verse 17-18

"We are about to reveal to you a mighty word." Surah Muzzammil (Chapter 73) Verse 5

It is obvious that the word "Revelation" and "Recitation" are related to the text and not to the content in anyway. After reading the above verse and other verse about revelation upon the Holy Prophet with accuracy, we come to know that there is no doubt that the words, verbal structure and style of text along with its content was revealed upon Holy Prophet by means of an angel called Gabriel. Holy Prophet and angel Gabriel had only intermediary role in receiving and delivering the revelation. A very explicit distinction between the text of the Holy Qur'an and quoted sayings from the Prophet (PBUH) is not hidden from any expert in Arabic. This is another reason for the words of the Holy Qur'an being divine. When Arabs living in the time of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) who were familiar with the remarks of the Prophet, after hearing the first verse of the Holy Qur'an from the Holy Prophet, suddenly lofty themes of the oceans became visible for them, they found some words that were far superior than a man-made phrase, they admitted the sacredness of these words. Some of them became believer immediately while others admitted the beauty and sacredness of the Holy Qur'an but carried on their way of hostility. (Al-Tamheed Fi Uloomel Holy Qur'an, 28-29/4)

Zarqani who was aware of the delicacy of this proof, writes under the title "style of Hadith (Narration of Holy Prophet) and the style of the Holy Qur'an" here is the following text:

Arabs living in the time of the Holy Prophet knew Holy Prophet, and were aware of talking power of the Holy Prophet before the revelation of the Holy Qur'an, still none of the deniers of the Holy Prophet thought of saying that this Holy Qur'an is words of Mohammad, because very clear difference in the words of the Holy Prophet and the words of the Holy Qur'an was observed by them.

"(Muhammad), tell them, "Had God wanted I would not have recited it (the Book) to you nor would I have told you anything about it. I lived among you for a whole life-time before it was revealed. Will you then not understand?" Surah Yunus (Chapter 10) Verse 16

4-Teachings, facts and the content of Holy Qur'an is of such greatness, depth and breadth that putting them into the word and phrase with its entire knowledge and its entire teachings that it demonstrates its heavenly truth is beyond the power of Human. The Holy Qur'an says about the magnitude and greatness of revelation: "We are about to reveal to you a mighty word." Surah Muzzammil (Chapter 73) Verse 5

On the other side Holy Prophet is introduced as a person physically like other people of his time but with the main difference, that the Holy Prophet use to receive the divine revelation

"Say, "I am only a mortal like you but I have received revelation that there is only one Lord." Surah Kahf (Chapter 18) Verse 110

Prophet was pure as he was kept away from all uncleanness and impurity (Surah Ahzab, 33/33), due to which he was able to receive the divine revelation then convey the message to the people without the slightest reduction and addition. As expressing the heavenly truths and profound content intended by God, in the shape of words is out of the power of humankind and Jinn, (Surah Isra, 17/88) in the same way it is impossible for a Prophet as well.

Jalaluddin Seeyuti provides the same proof as above. As he says:

Each word of the Holy Qur'an has many meanings that cannot be encircled by anyone, so no one can replace a single word of the Holy Qur'an with a new word that would include all aspects of the Holy Qur'anic word. (Al Itqan Fi Uloom el Qur'an, Seeyuti 1/59) The results obtained from the above arguments that the words, phrases, and sentence structure of the Holy Qur'an alike to its meaning is from God which descended upon Holy Prophet by angel Gabriel and reached to the mankind without the slightest changes. The book which is called The Holy Qur'an from the time it was revealed till now is a blessing of God, its every single word is divine and it addresses all the people equally in every era.

2. The content of The Holy Qur'an is from God and the words of the Holy Qur'an is from the Holy Prophet (PBUH)

The second view is that only the divine content and the concept was revealed upon Holy Prophet whereas receiving this divine knowledge was impossible for mankind without revelation, but Holy Prophet composed these teachings in his own words. The root of this view is from a known theologian of the third century Ibne Kellab, Abu Muhammad Abdullah Bin Sa'id Bin Al-Qattan Basari. He was a famous theologian of the third century according to the lunar calendar. He is a pioneer compiler of theology, later on he was followed by Hasan Al-Ash'ari who followed his theological beliefs and founded a belief called "Ash'ari theology". Ibne Kellab became one of the known opponents of Mu'tazilah (Mutazilites). He compiled some books against Mu'tazilah. Date of his death is not noted accurately, but it is written he passed away after 240 according to lunar calendar. Theological beliefs and ideas of Ibne Kellab had a significant impact on the formation of Islamic theology. After him theologians supported him or opposed him severely in theological discussion. His followers were called "Kelabya". (Great Islamic Encyclopedia, Volume 4, under the supervision of Sayyid Kazim Bojnordi) He was the leading theorist of the school of Ash'arah. He believed that God's word is one of his essential attributes and it is mortal. Moreover, other than his views that have been acceptable by the Ash'ari there are some ideas that he does not share with others about the Holy Qur'an and other divine scriptures. He believes that the mortal word of God was never descended in the world as a compiled book. Ibne Kellab's proof is as follows: Depiction and interpretation of word of Holy Qur'an in Arabic or Hebrew is other than exact word of the Holy Qur'an, Holy Qur'an is only an interpretation and depiction of word of God. According to his belief after the revelation was descended and it was heard by the Holy Prophet the phenomenon of "interpretation" took place which had Arabic characteristics. (Hermeneutics of Scripture and Tradition, written by Mujtahid Shabestari 126) He believed that the limitation of Arabic language caused word of God to be limited and gave word of God a humanly color. (Hermeneutics of Scripture and Tradition, written by Mujtahid Shabestari) Although the opinions of Ibne Kellab about the text of the Holy Qur'an was greatly attacked by great scholars such as Qazi Abdul Jabbar, Abul Hasan Ash'ari in the fourth and fifth centuries and by Ibne Taymiyyah in the sixth century. (Hermeneutics of Scripture and Tradition written by Mujtahid Shabestari 126) But since beginning till now this idea has always been a rare view among the scholars of interpretation of Holy Qur'an. Stating this viewpoint beside the first one (the view of the majority of Muslims in the first centuries of Islam) in the important sources such as Al-Burhan of Zarkashi, Al Itqan of Seeyuti, Manahelul Irfan of Zarqani and quotation of previous scholars indicates the continuous presence of this viewpoint in the religious discussion, although none of these sources have accepted this view. It looks like the above view is of more interest in the last century, since modern writers in Islamic world tend to promote this view. This view is found in some of the books of Dr. Nasr Hamid Abu Zayd, an Egyptian thinker. Some writers who consider the revelation a personal experience of the Holy Prophet believed in this opinion intentionally or unintentionally.

Review and Analyze

Supporters of the above view did not prove their viewpoint with logical reasons rather they just raised their claim. Perhaps some verses of the Holy Qur'an can be a proof and documentation for this viewpoint, where God says in the Holy Qur'an that I have revealed this Holy Qur'an on your heart, obviously revelation on the heart does not need any word or phrases. (Tareekh wa Uloom Qur'an written by Mir Mohammad Zarandi page 45)

Have a look to the following verses:

"It has been revealed through the trustworthy Spirit * to your heart, so that you will warn (the people of the dangers of disobeying God)." Surah Shu'araa (Chapter 26) Verse 193-194

Based on the above verses of the Holy Qur'an was revealed on heart of blessed Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). Inserting anything into the heart does not need any verbal phrases to be applied. We need to use the word when we want to convey our message by means of ears which is one of our five senses. It seems that the five proofs that we have mentioned above cannot only prove the first viewpoint rather it can easily reject the second viewpoint as well. To prove the view point mentioned by using the above verses is controversial and flawed in some angles:

First Point: The verses that we have mentioned before in order to prove the first viewpoint shows clearly that the word of the Holy Qur'an are divine, Arabic structure of Holy Qur'an, the word "Recitation" and the word "revelation" all of which have considered characteristics of text. We talked about the Prophet "that he follows the divine revelation and does not interfere in changing the revelation". In some verses the Arabic language of the Holy Qur'an is referred directly to God (like in verse no 3-4 of Surah Zukhruf and verse no 5 of Surah Yusuf)

Therefore the interpretation of verses of the Holy Qur'an about the Holy Qur'an being revealed on the heart of the Holy Prophet must be compatible with large collection of those verses.

Second Point: divineness of the word of the Holy Qur'an is not in contrary with revelation of the Holy Qur'an upon the heart of the Holy Prophet, because neither the Holy Qur'an nor any of the scholars believed the words of the Holy Qur'an and the revelation is explainable with sensory and material mechanisms. Although the Holy Qur'an emphasized and faithful believed in it from beginning till now, that the Holy Qur'an was revealed in divine words of Arabic language, but it does not mean that it should involve sensory organs like mouth, tongue and ears for the sake of revelation. As the divine revelation is from the categories of intuitive knowledge (Elme Hozoori) so the apparent structure of Holy Qur'an can be from the categories of intuitive knowledge as well. (Rahnama Shenasi written by Mesbah Yazdi, Page26-27)Therefore as the concept and meaning of revelation descends on the Holy Prophet intuitively and Holy Prophet gets connect to the ocean of divine knowledge, at the same time does the phrases and sentences start building according to it, this is how the Holy Prophet use to convey the message to the people without any addition or reduction. Accordingly, the verses of the Holy Qur'an that mention the heart of the Holy Prophet to be location of revelation, are not only in contrary to those verses which consider the text of the Holy Qur'an to be divine, rather both groups of the verse have complemented each other. Allama Tabatabai has written in his book explaining the verse number 193-194 of Surah Shu'araa, which says that the Holy Qur'an was revealed on the heart of the Holy Prophet, he rejects the viewpoint that attributes the text of the Holy Qur'an to the Holy Prophet. He believes that the word "heart" in this verse is the soul of the man which has sense, understanding and willpower. He asserts clearly that when revelation was revealed upon the Holy Prophet, none of his external senses were involved in it. At the time of revelation the Holy Prophet use to see the angel and hear his voice but without using his eyes, ear and external sense (Al Meezan written by Tabatabai, 15/317).

Third point: after the verses 193-194 in Surah Shu'araa, it is written in the next verse, verse no 195 "*It has been revealed in plain Arabic.*" This shows that revelation upon heart is not in contrary with divine text of Holy Qur'an. Therefore the verses that are about the Holy Qur'an being revealed on the heart of the Holy Prophet cannot be acceptable proof for the second viewpoint. Thus this viewpoint is merely a claim without any proper proof.

Result

Firstly; the word "recitation" is used for what has been revealed from God to the Holy Prophet, shows that the words of the Holy Qur'an are divine. Secondly the phrase "word of God" has been used in the Holy Qur'an to define the text of the Holy Qur'an twice.

"If any of the idolaters ask you to give them refuge, give them asylum so that they may hear the words of God. Then, return them to their towns for they are an ignorant people." Surah Tawba (chapter 9) verse 6

"They desire to change the word of Allah." Surah Fatah (Chapter 48) verse 15

Meaning of the "word of God" in the above verse is part of the Holy Qur'an. "Word of God" signifies the divineness of text of the Holy Qur'an. According to the Arabic dictionary "Word" means a word that conveys the meaning and sounds consecutively in order to define what has been said. Therefore, having a word and meaning is derived from the concept of "word". That is why in verse 6 of Surah Tawba uses verb "hear". Furthermore, referring a word to the speaker is true as long as he puts the meaning into the words and composes it himself. If the Holy Prophet had composed the words and placed the meanings into the words of the Holy Qur'an, so the Holy Qur'an is not going to be word of God. The result is considering the "Word of God" in the Holy Qur'an and the concept of "word" which should include text also, indicates that words of the Holy Qur'an are Godly and divine.

References

1. Holy Quran
2. Dictionary of Lisanul Arab, written by Mohammad Ben Mokram Ibne Manzoor, Published by Adab Al-Houza 1405 (lunar) , City of Qum Iran.
3. Journal of Quranic Research by Musa Hussaini, Published by the General Office for Public Relation and International Affairs, branch of Khorasane Razavi, 1379 (Iranian Calendar)
4. History of Contemporary Religious and Islamic Movements by Ali Asghar Halabi, Published by Bahbahani, Tehran Iran, 1374 (Iranian Calendar)
5. Hermeneutic and New Hermeneutics, written by Baha-o-Deen Khorramshahee, Published by Keyhan, Tehran 1364 (Iranian Calendar)
6. Dictionary of Al-Mofradat Fe Ghareeb Al-Quran, By Ragheb Isfahani, Published by Uroomye 1385 (Iranian Calendar)
7. Al Burhan Fi Uloom-el-Quran, Written by Badr-o-Deen Mohammad Ben Abdullah Zarkashi, Published by Darol Hadith, Cairo 1427 (Lunar Calendar)
8. Manahelul Irfan Fi Uloomel Quran, Written by Mohammad Abdul Azeem Zarqani, Published by Darol Ahya Al-Toras Al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon 1427 (Lunar Calendar)
9. Al Itqan Fi Uloomel Quran, Written by Jalal-o-Deen Abdurahman Seooti, Published by Fakhr-o-Deen, 1380 (Iranian Calendar)
10. New Theology, Written by Hadi Sadeqi, Publisher Ketabe Taha Wa Nashre Islami, Qum Iran, 1382 (Iranian Calendar)
11. Quran In Islam, Written by Mohammad Hussain Tabatabai, Published by Daftare Intesharate Islami, 1361 (Iranian Calendar)
12. Tafseere Al-Meezan, Written by Mohammad Hussain Tabatabai, Published by institute of Nashre Islami, Qum Iran.
13. Recognition of Holy Quran, Written by Mohammad Taqi Misbah Yazdi, Volume 1, Published by institute of Education and learning of Imam Khomeini, 1384 (Iranian Calendar)
14. Al-Tamheed Fi Uloom-el-Quran, Written by Mohammad Hadi Marefat, Publisher: Hoza of Qum Iran, 1368 (Iranian Calendar)
15. Great Islamic Encyclopedia, Written by Mohammad Kazem Ben Hassan Moosavi Bejnordi, Volume 4 , First Edition Tehran, 1370 (Iranian Calendar)
16. Hermeneutics of Quran and Sunna, Written by Mujtahid Shabstari Mohammad, Published by Tarhe No, Tehran, 1375
17. History and Uloom Quran, Written by Syed Abul Fazl Meer Mohammad Zarandi, Second Edition, Qum Iran, Publisher: Daftare Intesharate Islami, 1369 (Iranian Calendar)
18. Recognition of Leader, Mohammad Taqi Misbah Yazdi, Qum Iran, Publisher: Markaze Modereyate Hozeye Elmeya, 1367 (Iranian Calendar)
19. Collection of Books of Motahari, Volume 2, Publisher: Sadra, Tehran 1376 (Iranian Calendar)
20. Reason and Religious Belief, Michael Peterson, Traslated by Ahmad Naraqi and Ebraheem Soltani, Tehran, Publisher: Tarhe No, 1379 (Iranian Calendar)
21. Al-Tahqeeq Fi Kalem Al-Quran, Written by Hassan Mostafavi, Tehran, Published by Wezarate Farhand Wa Irshade Islami, 1371 (Iranian Calendar)
22. Uloom Quran in School of Ahlulbeit, Written by Ali Asgar Naseheyen, Published by Islamic University of Razavi, Mashad Iran, 1389 (Iranian Calendar)
23. Mafhoom Al-Nas Derasa Fi Uloom Al-Quran, Written by Nasr Hamed Abu Zaid, Fifth Edition, Beirut Lebanon, Publisher: Al Markaz Al Saqfi Al Arabi, 2000